



MONITOR

Civil-Military Relations in Pakistan

April 2017



In this Issue

- 1) The DG ISPR Tweet on the Letter by PMO
- 2) Initial Civil Military Disagreement on Dawn 'Leaks'
- 3) Interior Minister Chaudhry Nisar's Comments on the POF Labour Day Ceremony
- 4) Clarification by the DG ISPR on Military's Stance on the Panama Papers Case Judgment
- 5) Membership of the JIT in Panama Case and Senator Aitzaz Ahsan's Comments
- 6) Former COAS Gen. (R) Raheel Sharif Leaves for Saudi Arabia to head IMAFT
- 7) PTI Chairman Mr. Imran Khan talks about his meeting with COAS General Qamar Javed Bajwa
- 8) Premier-COAS Interactions
- 9) Resignation of Afghan Minister of Defence and Afghan Army Chief
- 10) Indonesian Military Chief Reproached by the Indonesian President

This monitor is meant to identify key developments during the month on Civil Military Relations in Pakistan with selected high-profile international developments included occasionally. In this issue:

The DG ISPR Tweet on the Letter by PMO



Maj Gen Asif Ghafoor ✓
@OfficialDGISPR

Following

Notification on Dawn Leak is incomplete and not in line with recommendations by the Inquiry Board. Notification is rejected.

RETWEETS
10,716

LIKES
23,986



2:52 AM - 29 Apr 2017

↩ 9.1K

↻ 11K

♥ 24K

The DG ISPR Tweet on the leaked letter of the PMO on the Dawn Leaks Inquiry Committee

The issue of 'Dawn Leaks' Inquiry hit a new high on April 29, 2017, after a letter of the Prime Minister Office on the Dawn Leaks Inquiry Committee appeared on the social media and was picked up by various TV channels.

The letter signed by the Principal Secretary to the Prime Minister, marked to the Secretary Interior and copied to the Cabinet Secretary, Secretary Establishment and Secretary Information communicated the Prime Minister's approval of the withdrawal of the portfolio of the Special Assistant to Prime Minister on Foreign Affairs Syed Tariq Fatemi and proceedings under Efficiency and Discipline Rules 1973 against Rao Tehseen Ali, Principal Information Officer (PIO) of the Ministry of Information. The same day, DG ISPR Maj. Gen. Asif Ghafoor tweeted, 'Notification on Dawn Leak is incomplete and not in line with recommendations by the Inquiry Board. Notification is rejected.'¹

After this tweet was posted, Minister for Interior, Chaudhry Nisar Ali Khan held a press conference in which he said, 'institutions don't talk to each other by tweets' and characterised tweets as 'deadly poison for Pakistan's democracy, our system and justice.' He said that the notification for the 'Dawn Leaks' Report is to be issued by the Interior Ministry and not the PM Office and that the notification 'will be according to the unanimous recommendations of the [Dawn Leaks inquiry] committee.'²

On April 30, 2017, media reports announced that a meeting of the Prime Minister with his close associates was held in Lahore to discuss the ISPR tweet.

On May 01, 2017, Punjab Law Minister, Rana Sanaullah stated that the Government had decided to make the operative part of the 'Dawn Leaks' report public and the notification will be issued by the Ministry of Interior.³

1. Tweet also released in the form of a press release that can be accessed at: https://www.ispr.gov.pk/front/main.asp?o=t-press_release&id=3952&cat=army
2. Interior Minister not PM Office to issue Dawn Leak notification: Nisar, Geo, April 29, 2017 as accessed on May 09, 2017 at: <https://www.geo.tv/latest/139918-Interior-Ministry-not-PM-Office-to-issue-Dawn-Leak-notification-Nisar>
3. Operative part of inquiry report to be made public, Dawn, updated on May 02, 2017, as accessed on May 09, 2017 at: <https://www.dawn.com/news/1330456>

PILDAT believes that the following points with regards to the DG ISPR Tweet on the 'Dawn Leaks' issue need to be considered:

1. The use of the word 'rejected' and the manner in which the Tweet was phrased was inappropriate. Moreover, the Pakistan Army's public rejection of the letter issued by the Prime Minister's Office will only go on to reinforce the image, already held in certain sections of the international community, that the Armed forces of Pakistan are free from civilian oversight. Hence, in the larger interest of the country and to further avoid harming the state of relations between the civilian institutions and the armed forces, the ISPR Tweet of April 29, 2017 should at least be withdrawn or a part of the Tweet should be revised in its wording. *(Note: On May 10, ISPR Press Release announced the withdrawal of its tweet of April 29; detail and analysis will be covered in PILDAT's monitor of the month of May)*
2. Most of the controversy has emanated because the agreed report has not been made public. Therefore, we urge the Government to make the complete report public barring those parts that may threaten national security or at least its recommendations be made public without further loss of time.
3. Both sides should address the obstacles and impediments in the way of addressing similar issues. While such an institutional arrangement existed in the form of the National Security Committee (NSC), it has remained largely dysfunctional. Whatever the reasons for its dormancy may be, whether they include lack of trust or interest by the Government or the Military leadership, they need to be immediately addressed and the NSC should be activated as the principal forum for addressing security issues requiring civil-military consultation.
4. In an honourable, democratic, sovereign country like Pakistan, the final authority rests with its elected representatives. All institutions of the State should, in practical terms, demonstrate the acceptance of this position in full conformity to the constitution of the country.
5. Democracy does not only mean elections, but it means inclusive government in which views of all segments are taken into consideration and decision-making is collective and institutional. An increased tendency for more personalized and whimsical decision-making has been observed in the past few years. Even at one point, the Supreme Court had intervened and stated in its judgment that 'the Prime Minister is the head of the Cabinet but he can neither supplant nor replace it. He cannot exercise its powers by itself.'⁴ Both the Federal and the Provincial Governments must ensure that institutionalized decision-making takes place through their cabinets while political parties should also use institutional forums for their policy decisions.
6. Lastly, the Parliament and the Provincial Assemblies should also exercise their role of effective oversight in making sure the elected Government are adhering to the principles of democracy and good governance.

Timeline of the case of DAWN Leaks

Date	Item
October 06, 2016	<p>Dawn published the story 'Exclusive: Act against militants or face international isolation, civilians tell military' which Dawn claimed was 'based on conversations with Dawn of individuals present in the crucial meetings (that) week.'⁵ In the leaked meeting, a verbal confrontation between Chief Minister Shahbaz Sharif and then DG ISI Lt. Gen. Rizwan Akhtar was narrated in which Chief Minister claimed that security establishment works behind the scenes to set certain groups free whenever action is taken against them. In the end, Prime Minister Sharif directed Lt. Gen. Akhtar to 'tour the provinces at the direction of the prime minister, issue fresh orders to ISI sector commanders and meet with provincial apex committees to chalk out specific actions that need to be taken in various provinces' and Lt. Gen. Akhtar 'readily agreed.'⁶</p> <p>The same day, the first rejoinder was issued by the Spokesman of the Prime Minister saying the story is 'an amalgamation of fiction and half-truths which too are invariably reported out of context.'⁷</p> <p>Another rejoinder was issued by the Prime Minister Office the same day, while the previous one was initially deleted from the website, and it characterized the Dawn news story as 'fabricated.' However, at present only the first rejoinder is present in the website.</p> <p>Meanwhile, the office of the Chief Minister of Punjab also denied the comments attributed to Mr. Shahbaz Sharif in the news story. Dismissing it as a baseless story, he emphasized that besides his respect for the institution of the armed forces, on an individual level he also had 'the highest respect for the present DG ISI for his professionalism, commitment to duty and sincerity of purpose.'⁸</p>

4. PM must obtain cabinet approval for fiscal moves: SC, Dawn, updated on August 19, 2017 and accessed on May 09, 2017 at: <https://www.dawn.com/news/1278511>

5. Exclusive: Act against militants or face international isolation, civilians tell military, Dawn, October 06, 2016, and accessed on May 09, 2017 at: <https://www.dawn.com/news/1288350>

6. *ibid.*

7. Press Release by the PM Office may be accessed at: http://pmo.gov.pk/press_release_details.php?pr_id=1566

8. PM, CM offices reject 'speculative' story on national security, The Nation, October 07, 2016, and accessed on May 09, 2017 at: <http://nation.com.pk/national/07-Oct-2016/pm-cm-offices-reject-speculative-story-on-national-security>

October 10, 2016	A meeting was held at the Prime Minister House, chaired by the PM, and attended by the Federal Minister for Interior, CM Punjab, the COAS, and the DG ISI. Presser released after the meeting stated that 'the participants of the meeting expressed concern over the publication of a fabricated news story in the Daily Dawn pertaining to security issues purportedly discussed in a meeting of the National Security Committee in the last week and the participants were unanimous that the published story was clearly violative of universally acknowledged principles of reporting on National Security issues and has risked the vital interest through inclusion of inaccurate and misleading contents which had no relevance to actual discussion and fact.'
October 11, 2016	Mr. Cyril Almeida's name was placed on the Exit Control List (ECL).
October 14, 2016	A press release issued by the ISPR following a Corps Commander Conference 'expressed serious concern over feeding of false and fabricated story of an important security meeting held at PM house and viewed it as breach of national security.'
October 15, 2016	After a meeting of the Federal Minister of Interior with the representatives of APNS, CPNE and PFUJ, Mr. Almeida's name was removed from the ECL.
October 28, 2016	The Federal Ministers for Interior and Finance, along with the Chief Minister of the Punjab 'call on' the COAS at the GHQ. According to the Press Release issued by the ISPR, the meeting took place between 4:00-5:30PM and stated that 'the delegation briefed the COAS on the progress of investigation and recommendations related to planted story of National Security breach of 6 Oct 2016'. The DG ISI was also present on the occasion.
October 29, 2016	A Press Release was issued by PMO stating that 'the planted story related to the NSC and NAP meetings published in Daily Dawn on 6th October was a breach of national security. Evidence available so far points to a lapse on the part of Information Minister, who has been directed to step down from office to enable holding of an independent and detailed inquiry. An inquiry committee including senior officers of ISI, MI and IB is being formed by the Government of Pakistan to clearly apportion blame, identify interests and motives and expose all those responsible for this episode for stern action in the national interest'. The seven-member committee formed to investigate Dawn leaks was headed by Justice Retd. Aamer Raza Khan included Establishment Secretary, Punjab Ombudsman, FIA Punjab Director, and one representative each from the ISI, MI, and the IB. According to initial news reports, the committee was given 30 days to submit its report. ¹⁰
March 09, 2017	A Press Release was issued by ISPR following a Corps Commanders' conference which stated that in the conference, 'Dawn leak issue was also discussed.' ¹¹
April 18, 2017	Director General (DG) ISPR Major General Asif Ghafoor said that, 'there was no word on consensus on the issue of 'Dawn Leaks' during the court of inquiry... DG ISPR was responding to a question about Interior Minister's reported statement that consensus was not developed on the Leaks issue in the committee earlier and two days ago consensus was reached.' On a separate occasion in response, Interior Minister Chaudhry Nisar Ali Khan said that 'he stood by his statement that the delay in streamlining recommendations on the Leaks issue happened due to lack of consensus in committee. He said that ISPR DG had nothing to do with this committee nor he was DG at that time when this committee was formed.' ¹²
April 25, 2017	A spokesman of Interior Ministry announced that Interior Ministry had received the Dawn Leaks report on April 25, 2017 at 6:45 pm and it would be submitted to Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif on April 26, 2017 after going through it in details. ¹³
April 26, 2017	PM's Spokesperson Mr. Musaddik Malik confirmed that Prime Minister has received the report of the Inquiry Committee on 'Dawn Leaks.' However, according to a news report, Malik did not confirm whether the Prime Minister had received the report that day or earlier. ¹⁴
April 29, 2017	A letter signed by the Principal Secretary to the Prime Minister on the Dawn Leaks Inquiry Committee found its way to the social media and then to the electronic media. The letter marked to the Secretary Interior communicated PM's approval of the actions against Mr. Tariq Fatemi, Special Assistant to the PM on Foreign Affairs and Rao Tehseen Ali, Principal Information Officer (PIO) of the Government of Pakistan. The letter communicated the PM decision to

9. ISPR Press Release may be accessed at: https://www.ispr.gov.pk/front/main.asp?o=t-press_release&id=3507&cat=army

10. Committee to probe Dawn story formed, Dawn, November 8, 2016 may be accessed at: <https://www.dawn.com/news/1294952>

11. ISPR Press Release may be accessed at: https://www.ispr.gov.pk/front/main.asp?o=t-press_release&cat=army&date=2017/3/9

12. DG ISPR, interior minister differ on delay in Leaks probe, The News, April 18, 2017, and accessed on May 09, 2017 at:

<https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/199314-DG-ISPR-interior-minister-differ-on-delay-in-Leaks-probe>

13. Interior ministry receives Leaks report, The News, published on April 26, 2017 and accessed on May 09, 2017 at: <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/200836-Interior-ministry-receives-Leaks-report-Will-be-presented-to-PM-today>

14. PM Nawaz receives Dawn leaks inquiry, Geo, April 26, 2017, accessed on May 09, 2017 at: <https://www.geo.tv/latest/139541-PM-receives-Dawn-leaks-inquiry-report>

- April 29, 2017**, withdraw the portfolio of Foreign Affairs from Syed Tariq Fatemi and to proceed under Efficiency and Discipline Rules 1973 against Rao Tehseen Ali. DG ISPR Maj. Gen. Asif Ghafoor tweeted, 'Notification on Dawn Leak is incomplete and not in line with recommendations by the Inquiry Board. Notification is rejected.' Minister for Interior Chaudhry Nisar stated in a press conference that, 'institutions don't talk to each other [over Twitter]' while also characterizing these tweets as 'deadly poison for Pakistan's democracy, our system and justice.' He said that the notification for the Dawn Leaks Report is to be issued by the Interior Ministry and not the PM Office and that the notification 'will be according to the unanimous recommendations of the [Dawn Leaks inquiry] committee.'¹⁵
-
- April 30, 2017**, A meeting of the Pakistan Muslim League Nawaz (PML-N) leadership was held in Lahore to, as per media reports, to discuss the ISPR tweet.
-
- May 01, 2017**, Punjab Law Minister, Rana Sanaullah stated that the government has decided to make the operative part of the Dawn Leaks report public and the notification will be issued by the Interior ministry.

Initial Civil Military Disagreement on Dawn 'Leaks'

Dawn Leaks had been a subject in which previously also the disagreement between the Government and the Military leadership had appeared.

Earlier, on April 18, 2017, the Minister of Interior Chaudhry Nisar Ali Khan said that the delay in 'streamlining the recommendations by the inquiry committee on the Dawn 'Leaks' happened because consensus was not developed in the inquiry committee.' To this, DG ISPR Maj. Gen. Asif Ghafoor said that there was 'no word on consensus on the issue of Dawn 'Leaks' during the court of inquiry.'¹⁶



Maj. Gen. Asif Ghafoor and Interior Minister Chaudhry Nisar Ali Khan

On a separate occasion, the Interior Minister maintained his earlier statement while also adding that the 'ISPR DG had nothing to do with this committee nor was he Director General at that time when this committee was formed.'¹⁷ This shows that a certain degree of tension existed between the Government and Military leadership, which came out in full public gaze on April 29, 2017.

Interior Minister Chaudhry Nisar's Comments on the POF Labour Day Ceremony

On the morning of May 01, 2017, two suspected terrorists were reportedly killed in an exchange of fire with the local police in Taxila. The security agencies concerned reported this to the Interior Ministry and warned that terrorists may target the annual Labour Day ceremony at the Pakistan Ordnance Factory (POF) which was to be addressed by the Interior Minister and some other federal ministers.

Interior Minister Chaudhry Nisar Ali Khan was to attend as Chief Guest of the Labour Day Ceremony planned at the POF. Before his address to the ceremony, the Ministry of Interior released the following statement: "The May Day ceremony at POF is a long-standing tradition and, God-willing, the other federal ministers and I will participate in the ceremony as planned."¹⁸

Speaking at the Labour Day Ceremony at POF, the Interior Minister questioned the "performance" of security agencies that could not ensure the safety of sensitive installations such as POF.¹⁹

Clarification by the DG ISPR on Military's Stance on the Panama Papers Case Judgment

A Tweet by DG ISPR on the Panama Case Judgment on April 08, 2017, which was ostensibly issued as clarification for an earlier comment by the Director General ISPR Maj. Gen. Asif Ghafoor on the same issue, created more confusion than clarity. The Tweet stated that 'Response to Q on Panama in UK reported incomplete / out of context. Army, like every Pakistani awaits a decision based on justice and

15. Nisar questions 'commotion' over Dawn Leaks, says Interior Ministry yet to issue notification, Geo, April 29, 2017, accessed on May 09, 2017 at: <https://www.geo.tv/latest/139918-Interior-Ministry-not-PM-Office-to-issue-Dawn-Leak-notification-Nisar>

16. DG ISPR, interior minister differ on delay in Leaks probe, The News, April 18, 2017, and accessed on May 09, 2017 at: <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/199314-DG-ISPR-interior-minister-differ-on-delay-in-Leaks-probe>

17. *ibid.*

18. Nisar questions agencies' ability to protect sensitive installations, Dawn, updated on May 02, 2017, and accessed on May 09, 2017 at: <https://www.dawn.com/news/1330457>

19. We'd be secure only if Wahlabourers are secure, The News, May 01, 2017, accessed on May 09, 2017 at: <https://www.thenews.com.pk/latest/201836-Wed-be->

merit.' According to news reports, the comment to which the Tweet referred to was given on April 05, 2017 and it stated that the Supreme Court's verdict on the Panama case will be acceptable to the army.²⁰

It is not clear as to why the DG ISPR Maj. Gen. Asif Ghafoor felt the need to issue a follow-up comment on this matter. Naturally, it is for the Supreme Court to decide what constitutes justice and merit in the Panama Paper's case and it is unnecessary to say that the court verdict will be acceptable to the army. Court verdict is binding on all including the army and no one has a choice about its being acceptable.

Membership of the JIT in Panama Case and Senator Aitzaz Ahsan's Comments

On April 20, 2017, the Supreme Court of Pakistan announced a six-member Joint Investigative Tribunal (JIT), headed by a member of the Federal Investigative Agency (FIA), for the purpose of investigating the Panama Case.

The JIT would also include a member each of the following institutions: the State Bank of Pakistan (SBP), Securities and Exchange Commission of Pakistan (SECP), the National Accountability Bureau (NAB), the Inter-Services Intelligence (ISI) and the Military Intelligence (MI).

While the inclusion of members from ISI and MI is rather odd as the investigation of Panama Case does not directly match with their departmental roles and expertise, it is even more odd that a member of the Intelligence Bureau (IB), being the prime civilian intelligence agency, was not included in the JIT. If NAB and FIA could be represented in the JIT, IB should not have been excluded.

In Dawn's editorial of April 21, 2017 on the same subject, it was observed that 'the inclusion of the military-run intelligence agencies in a probe against a serving prime minister in matters of finance and the law is remarkable — and a precedent that should not be established... what is concerning about the composition of the JIT, especially with the inclusion of a Military Intelligence representative, is the signal it sends about the lack of institutional trust.'²¹

The inclusion of military run agencies was not able to escape controversy as the Leader of the Opposition in the Senate, Senator Aitzaz Ahsan, in a number of interviews following the Panama Judgment expressed his reservations regarding the constitution of the JIT. He is quoted to have said 'the in-laws of the daughter of Maryam Nawaz were closely linked to Director General ISI Lt. Gen. Naveed Mukhtar', hence implying that the investigation process may be biased one.²²

In an apparent response to these allegations of Senator Aitzaz Ahsan, DG ISPR Maj. Gen. Asif Ghafoor on April 21, 2017 issued a strongly worded Tweet that stated, 'Comments by few regarding head of premier int agency are baseless, misleading and unwarranted. Integrity of armed forces is beyond reproach.'

Following the 202nd Corps Commanders' Conference on April 24, 2017 (second Corps Commanders' Conference in a month; earlier one, which was the 201st Corps Commanders' Conference, was held on April 13, 2017 and discussed the case of Indian RAW agent Kulbushan Sudhir Jadhav), the ISPR Press Release stated, 'The forum pledged that Institution through its members in JIT shall play its due role in a legal and transparent manner fulfilling confidence reposed by the Apex Court of Pakistan.'²³

PILDAT believes that the following spoints need to be considered in this regard:

1. The inclusion of military-run agencies in the JIT formed to investigate the Panama Case is a sad reflection of the lack of trust in civilian institutions. The successive civilian governments also can not escape the blame for weakening the trust in various civilian institutions. In addition, there is a need for clearly defined institutional roles and responsibilities that can be carried out in an effective manner. It is unfortunate that Government departments such as the Securities and Exchange Commission of Pakistan (SECP), the Federal Board of Revenue (FBR), the National Accountability Bureau (NAB) and the Federal Investigative Agency (FIA) did not initiate proceedings not just in the case of the Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif and his family but all those who were named in the Panama Papers case until agitation forced at least some of them to undertake half-hearted actions.
2. While the Tweet by DG ISPR on April 21, 2017, in an apparent reference to Senator Aitzaz Ahsan's comments, may have been strongly worded, PILDAT believes that in the absence of evidence suggesting that a wrongdoing has been committed, mere relationship of the DG ISI Lt. Gen. Naveed Mukhtar with the Prime Minister's daughter, Ms. Maryam Nawaz, does not provide sufficient grounds for apprehensions over the role of the ISI member in the JIT.

Former COAS Gen. (R) Raheel Sharif Leaves for Saudi Arabia to head IMAFT

Former COAS General (R) Raheel Sharif left for Riyadh, Saudi Arabia on April 21, 2017 to head the International Military Alliance to Fight Terrorism (IMAF). According to the Minister of Defence, Khawaja Asif' sinter view on a TV channel, 'Gen Raheel Sharif has been

20. Army awaits Panamagate decision based on justice: DG ISPR, The Express Tribune, April 08, 2017, accessed on May 09, 2017 at: <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1378481/army-awaits-panamagate-decision-based-justice-like-every-pakistani/>

21. Panama Papers verdict, Dawn, April 21, 2017, accessed on May 09, 2017 at: <https://www.dawn.com/news/1328238/panama-papers-verdict>

22. ISPR shuns comments of Aitzaz Ahsan regarding links of DG ISI with Maryam Nawaz, Daily Pakistan, April 21, 2017, accessed on May 09, 2017 at: <https://en.dailypakistan.com.pk/pakistan/comments-regarding-head-of-premier-intelligence-agency-are-baseless-ispr/>

23. ISPR Press Release can be accessed at: https://www.ispr.gov.pk/front/main.asp?o=t-press_release&cat=army&date=2017/4/24

issued an NOC to join IMAFT after GHQ's consent and meeting legal formalities.²⁴ However, the exact time as to when the NOC was issued remained ambiguous and Mr. Asif's comment that the decision to issue the NOC was reached a 'couple of days back' (before General (R) Raheel Sharif departure)²⁵ did not lend much clarity on this either.

Earlier on April 11, 2017 in a session of the Senate of Pakistan, Mr. Asif had told the House that the Terms of Reference of General (R) Raheel Sharif's new job would be announced in May after a meeting of the Defence Ministers of member states of the IMAFT.²⁶

He promised that when General (R) Raheel Sharif would be issued an NOC, it would be presented in the House and the House would not be bypassed.²⁷ However, this promise remained unfulfilled.

Similarly, on April 13, 2017, in a session of the National Assembly of Pakistan Mr. Asif had said that once the formalities of the alliance would be completed, General (R) Raheel Sharif would apply for an NOC, which would be processed according to the relevant rules and regulations by the Ministry of Defence.²⁸ Mr. Asif promised the House that if the House asks, he would present the details of the process of the issuance of the NOC before it.²⁹

Mr. Asif's repeated assurances to the National Assembly and the Senate that they would be taken in confidence when General (R) Raheel Sharif would be issued an NOC are at odds with the hasty manner in which the former Army Chief of Pakistan obtained his NOC and left for Saudi Arabia.

PTI Chairman Mr. Imran Khan talks about his meeting with the COAS

PTI Chairman, Imran Khan in his interview with Mr. Hamid Mir on April 17, 2017 discussed his meeting with the COAS General Qamar Javed Bajwa, which had taken place on March 31, 2017.³⁰

Following are the key points of his meeting with the COAS as per Mr. Imran Khan:

1. Mr. Khan was the one who had asked for the meeting with the COAS when the border with Afghanistan was closed down affecting life in the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP).
2. The other main issue that Mr. Khan said he had wanted to discuss with General Qamar Javed Bajwa was the proposed KP-FATA merger and the problems associated with it.
3. The appointment of former COAS General (R) Raheel Sharif was also discussed with General Bajwa, who thinks that the former Army Chief would play the role of preventing war between Iran and Saudi Arabia and act as cement to bring them together.
4. Mr. Imran Khan also elaborated on his earlier statement right after his meeting with the COAS by saying that he had told General Bajwa that he (Khan) would not let the 2018 Election be carried out in the same manner as the 2013 Election and that democracy is not just in holding elections, but it is in holding free and fair elections. Mr. Khan also said that he expressed in front of General Bajwa that the army personnel should be inside and outside the polling booths to which the COAS said that the Pakistan Army, as an institution believes that free and fair elections should take place.

While Mr. Khan revealed the contents of his meeting with the COAS, it is noteworthy that no such revelation of the contents of the meeting came from the Pakistan Army's end.

In addition, if it were governance matters that were to be discussed in the meeting, then the correct forum was the KP Government and hence, it may have been the KP Chief Minister that could have called for a meeting with the COAS General Bajwa.

Premier-COAS Interactions

In the month of April 2017, the Prime Minister Muhammad Nawaz Sharif and Chief of Army Staff General Qamar Javed Bajwa met only once.

General Qamar Bajwa called on the Prime Minister in the Prime Minister House on April 12, 2017.

According to the press release issued by the Prime Minister Office, 'matters pertaining to professional preparedness of Pak Army, current security and border situation of the country came under discussion, during the meeting. The Chief of Army Staff also apprised the Prime Minister about the progress made in the ongoing operation Radd-ul-Fasaad.'³¹

24. Raheel leaves for Riyadh to command military alliance, Dawn, April 22, 2017, accessed on May 09, 2017 at: <https://www.dawn.com/news/1328531>

25. Gen Raheel off to S Arabia to lead Islamic alliance, The Express Tribune, April 21, 2017, accessed on May 09, 2017 at: <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1389984/gen-raheel-sharif-gets-noc-head-islamic-military-alliance-sources/>

26. Details can be found in the Senate Hansard of May 11, 2017 (Page 45) that can be accessed at: http://www.senate.gov.pk/uploads/documents/debates/1491987235_776.pdf

27. *ibid.*

28. Details can be accessed at Page 65: http://www.na.gov.pk/uploads/documents/1492499277_346.pdf

29. *ibid.*

30. Video of the interview can be accessed at: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Z4Gsv-DMXiY>

31. The Press Release by the PMO can be accessed at: http://pmo.gov.pk/press_release_details.php?pr_id=1768

International Developments Affecting Civil Military Relations

Resignation of Afghan Minister of Defence and Afghan Army Chief

The Afghan Minister of Defence, Mr. Abdullah Habibi and Afghan Army Chief General Qadam Shah Shaheem submitted their resignations on April 24, 2017 following the Taliban attack on an army base near Mazar-i-Sharif city, Afghanistan.³²

The Taliban attack had claimed the lives of more than 100 Afghan soldiers and certain quarters of the Afghan public had called for the resignation of the Minister of Defence and the Army Chief following the incident.³³

Some labeled the attack as an intelligence failure³⁴ and action by the Afghan Government following it involved the sacking of twelve army officers, including two generals.³⁵

Afghan security forces were made a target a week before this attack as well when simultaneous suicide assaults by the Taliban on two security compounds in Kabul had claimed 16 lives.³⁶



Afghan Minister of Defence, Abdullah Habibi (right) and Army Chief Qadam Shah (left) attending a Press Conference at the Ministry of Defence in Kabul

Indonesian Military Chief reportedly Reproached by the President of Indonesia

In January 2017, it was reported that the Indonesian military chief General Gatot Nurmantyo unilaterally suspended defence cooperation ties with Australia.³⁷

This reaction was the result of a report of 'offensive material' about West Papua found in a Special Forces Base in Australia.³⁸ West Papua is an Indonesian province that has tried to seek independence from Jakarta and was considered a sensitive topic for Indonesians.

Australian Defence Minister Ms. Marise Payne confirmed the complaints concerned "some teaching materials and remarks" at an Army language training facility in Australia, and that some military cooperation with Indonesia was put on hold.

Initially there appeared to be some contradiction between the Military's statement and that of the civilian Government on the same matter.

On January 04, 2017, the military stated that all forms of military cooperation with Australia were on hold while Indonesian Coordinating Minister for Political, Legal, and Security Affairs General (R) Wiranto claimed that only the language-training programme was suspended.³⁹

Reportedly, President of Indonesia Mr. Joko Widodo reproached the Army Chief General Nurmantyo in a meeting at the President' Palace held in the first week of January 2017.⁴⁰

In a subsequent development in February 2017, General Nurmantyo released a statement saying that he had accepted the apology of the Australian Army Chief General Angus Campbell.⁴¹ However, General Nurmantyo also stated that the resumption of military co-operation between the two countries could only continue after consultation with President Widodo.⁴²



Indonesian military Chief General Gatot Nurmantyo talks to reporters in Jakarta, Indonesia, January 5, 2017

32. Afghan defence minister, army chief resign after Taliban attack, Dawn, updated on April 25, 2017, and accessed on May 09, 2017 at: <https://www.dawn.com/news/1328928/afghan-defence-minister-army-chief-resign-after-taliban-attack>

33. Furious Afghans call for resignations after Taliban base attack, Dawn, April 24, 2017, accessed on May 09, 2017 at: <https://www.dawn.com/news/1328865/furious-afghans-call-for-resignations-after-taliban-base-attack>

34. Afghan defence minister, army chief resign after Taliban attack, Dawn, updated on April 25, 2017, and accessed on May 09, 2017 at: <https://www.dawn.com/news/1328928/afghan-defence-minister-army-chief-resign-after-taliban-attack>

35. ibid.

36. Over 100 killed, wounded in Taliban attack on Afghan military base, Dawn, April 22, 2017, accessed on May 09, 2017 at: <https://www.dawn.com/news/1328569/over-100-killed-wounded-in-taliban-attack-on-afghan-military-base>

37. Indonesia's president moves to rein in 'out of control' military chief, Reuters, January 09, 2017, accessed on May 09, 2017, at: <http://www.reuters.com/article/us-indonesia-australia-military-gatot-idUSKBN14T0MC>

38. Indonesia halts military cooperation with Australia over 'insulting' West Papua posters at training base, ABC News, updated on January 05, 2017, and accessed on May 09, 2017, at: <http://www.abc.net.au/news/2017-01-04/insulting-training-material-was-in-relation-to-west-papua/8162284>

39. Indonesia 'not suspending' all military ties with Australia, BBC News, January 05, 2017, accessed on May 09, 2017 at: <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-australia-38514742>

40. ibid.

41. Indonesia's military chief accepts apology from Australian Army over offensive training material, ABC News, February 09, 2017, accessed on May 09, 2017 at: <http://www.abc.net.au/news/2017-02-09/indonesia-accepts-apology-for-offensive-training-material/8254176>

42. ibid.